

Samyukta-āgama Studies

***Samyukta-āgama* Studies**

Anālayo

Contents

List of Tables and Plates	vii
DILA Series	ix
Foreword	xi
Introduction	1
<i>Sammādiṭṭhi-sutta</i> (MN 9)	11
<i>Mahāgopālaka-sutta</i> (MN 33)	41
<i>Cūlasaccaka-sutta</i> (MN 35)	57
<i>Cūlatanḥāsāṅkhaya-sutta</i> (MN 37)	91
<i>Sāleyyaka-sutta</i> (MN 41)	105
<i>Aṅgulimāla-sutta</i> (MN 86)	121
<i>Anāthapiṇḍikovāda-sutta</i> (MN 143)	139
<i>Nandakovāda-sutta</i> (MN 146)	155
<i>Bhikkhunī-saṃyutta</i> (SN 5.1–10)	201
<i>Vakkali-sutta</i> (SN 22.87)	235

<i>Channa-sutta</i> (SN 35.87)	257
<i>Rāhulovāda-sutta</i> (SN 35.121)	273
<i>Bhikkhunivāsaka-sutta</i> (SN 47.10)	293
<i>Sedaka-sutta</i> (SN 47.19)	311
<i>Ānanda-sutta</i> (SN 54.13)	333
<i>Dhammacakkappavattana-sutta</i> (SN 56.11)	347
<i>Dabba-sutta</i> (Ud 8.9–10)	389
<i>Devorohaṇavatthu</i> (Dhp-a 14.2)	415
Appendix (1)	441
Appendix (2)	463
Abbreviations	491
References	493
Index	571
Plates	593

List of Tables

Table 1: Translated <i>Samyukta-āgama</i> Discourses	8
Table 2: Sequence of Topics in SĀ 344 (etc.) and MN 9	22
Table 3: Basic Pattern of the Exposition	26
Table 4: The Scheme of the Four Truths	27
Table 5: Eleven Qualities in SĀ 1249 and Its Parallels	49
Table 6: Realms in MN 41	111
Table 7: Five Spheres of Liberation	285

List of Plates

Plate 1: Anāthapiṇḍika's Purchase of Jeta's Grove	593
Plate 2: The Acrobat Simile	594
Plate 3: The Buddha's Descent from Heaven	595

Dharma Drum Institute of Liberal Arts (DILA) Series

In 1994, Master Sheng Yen (1931–2009), the founder of Dharma Drum Buddhist College, began publishing the series of the Chung-Hwa Institute of Buddhist Studies. The purposes of publishing this series were to provide a venue for academic research in Buddhist studies supported by scholarships from the Chung-Hwa Institute of Buddhist Studies, to encourage top-quality Buddhist research, and to cultivate an interest in Buddhist research among the readership of the series. Moreover, by encouraging cooperation with international research institutions, Master Sheng Yen hoped to foster the academic study of Buddhism in Taiwan.

In keeping with this vision, in order to promote different aspects of exchange in academic research, we at Dharma Drum Buddhist College began to publish three educational series in 2007:

- Dharma Drum Buddhist College Research Series (DDBC-RS)
- Dharma Drum Buddhist College Translation Series (DDBC-TS)
- Dharma Drum Buddhist College Special Series (DDBC-SS)

In July 2014, the Taiwanese Ministry of Education deliberated on the merging of the Dharma Drum College of Humanities and Social Sciences and the Dharma Drum Buddhist College into the newly formed Dharma Drum Institute of Liberal Arts (DILA).

The new DILA incarnations of the former three series are now:

- Dharma Drum Institute of Liberal Arts Research Series (DILA-RS)
- Dharma Drum Institute of Liberal Arts Translation Series (DILA-TS)
- Dharma Drum Institute of Liberal Arts Special Series (DILA-SS)

Among our goals is the extensive development of digital publishing and information to adapt to the interactive and hyper-connective environment of the Web 2.0 age. This will allow research outcomes to be quickly shared and evaluated through the participation of individual users, through such media as blogs, shared tagging, wikis, social networks and so on. Our hope is to work towards developing an open environment for academic studies (perhaps called Science 2.0) on digital humanities that will be more collaborative and efficient than traditional academic studies. In this way, the Dharma Drum Institute of Liberal Arts will continue to help foster the availability of digital resources for Buddhist studies, the humanities, and the social sciences.

Bhikṣu Huimin
President, Dharma Drum Institute of Liberal Arts
15 August, 2014

Foreword

Bhikkhu Anālayo's numerous studies of the content of the Pāli Canon have ensured his reputation as the most productive scholar to work on it in the early twenty-first century. I would go so far as to say that they have done the world a service by raising to a new level our understanding of many aspects of what, after all, constitutes the most substantial and most authentic record of one of the greatest and most inspiring thinkers ever known. Anālayo's exemplary accuracy and attention to detail have been rigorously applied not only to the Pāli versions of the text but equally to their Chinese versions and to such others as exist, and everything has been lucidly explained in wholly intelligible English. He has not only made fascinating discoveries; even when one may have a doubt about a conclusion of his, he has supplied the building blocks for those who would like to attempt to build an edifice of their own.

It has become fashionable to deride the very idea that we have any access to the Buddha's original teachings. Anālayo is showing us that if we find no such access, it is because we are too lazy and/or too dim. It is only through dedicated labour like this that we are going to learn more about the Buddha's thought. The more students can be inspired by Anālayo's example, the more future generations will be able to shed light on teachings which have been distorted or neglected for far too long.

Richard Gombrich
27 December, 2014

Introduction

The translation of the *Samyukta-āgama* now found in the Taishō edition as entry number 99 under the title 雜阿含 was begun by Bǎoyún (寶雲) in the year 435 of the present era, based on an original recited by Guṇabhadra. This original appears to have been a Sanskrit original from a Mūlasarvāstivāda line of transmission.¹ Although in view of the language and school affiliation this may appear surprising, it nevertheless seems as if the manuscript of this discourse collection was acquired in Sri Lanka by the Chinese pilgrim Fǎxiǎn (法顯),² who stayed at the Abhayagiri monastery which at that time had lively contacts and exchange with other Buddhist schools in India.

The *Samyukta-āgama* (T 99) comes in fifty fascicles, of which only forty-eight correspond to the original text. Owing to a misplacing of fascicles, the order of the collection fell into disarray and two fascicles that do not belong to the original translation have been accidentally included. These are the twenty-third and twenty-fifth fascicles, containing SĀ 604 as well as SĀ 640 and SĀ 641.

With the help of a partial commentary on the *Samyukta-āgama*, preserved in the *Vastusaṃgrahaṇī* of the *Yogācārabhūmi*, the order of the *Samyukta-āgama* can be restored, after removal of the two unrelated fascicles.³

¹ On the school affiliation of the *Samyukta-āgama* cf., e.g., Lü 1963: 242, Waldschmidt 1980: 136, Mayeda 1985: 99, Enomoto 1986: 23, Hirakawa 1987: 513, Schmithausen 1987: 306, Choong 2000: 6 note 18, Hiraoka 2000, Harrison 2002: 1, Oberlies 2003: 64, Bucknell 2006: 685, and Glass 2010; on the underlying language cf. de Jong 1981: 108.

² Glass 2010: 200.

³ Anesaki 1908: 70–74.

The reconstructed *Samyukta-āgama* follows the same basic fivefold division as the *Samyutta-nikāya*, differing in so far as it has a chapter with sayings by disciples and a chapter with sayings by the Buddha or the Tathāgata. More than two thirds of the discourses in the *Samyukta-āgama* have parallels in the *Samyutta-nikāya*.

In the Taishō edition the *Samyukta-āgama* goes up to discourse number 1362.⁴ This does not take into account repetitions. If these are counted, the number of discourses in the *Samyukta-āgama* becomes considerably more; in fact in his edition Yinshùn (1983a, b, c) arrives at a total count of 13,412 discourses.⁵

Besides this *Samyukta-āgama* collection, the Taishō edition also contains a partially preserved Chinese translation of a *Samyukta-āgama* as entry number 100,⁶ a short *Samyukta-āgama* fragment as entry number 101,⁷ as well as several individually translated *Samyukta-āgama* discourses.⁸

In addition to material preserved in Chinese, *Samyukta-āgama* discourses are extant in the form of Sanskrit fragments,⁹ and in Tibetan translation, which for the most part take the form of discourse quotations in Śamathadeva's *Abhidharmakośopāyikāṭīkā*.¹⁰

⁴ From this count SĀ 604, SĀ 640, and SĀ 641 need to be subtracted as not being part of the original collection.

⁵ The count of discourses in the *Samyutta-nikāya* also varies considerably between different editions, depending on how the repetitions are counted; cf. Gethin 2007.

⁶ On this collection cf. esp. Bingenheimer 2011.

⁷ On this collection cf. esp. Harrison 2002.

⁸ T 102 to T 124.

⁹ For a convenient survey cf. Chung 2008.

¹⁰ On this source for early Buddhist discourse material in Tibetan translation cf. Mejer 1991: 63–64 as well as Skilling and Harrison 2005: 699; Honjō 1984 offers a convenient survey for locating relevant parallels.

Contents

The studies in the following chapters are revised versions of articles published previously. Each study is based on a partial or complete translation of the *Samyukta-āgama* discourse in question, followed by an examination of some aspects that I felt to be of further interest.¹¹

The first chapter takes up the theme of the four noble truths from two complementary perspectives, examining the basic underlying fourfold scheme in the context of an exposition on how to arrive at right view (MN 9), followed by turning to a comparison between this scheme and ancient Indian medicine. Contrary to the position taken by some scholars, I conclude that the four noble truths were probably inspired by an ancient Indian scheme of medical diagnosis.

The next chapter examines the importance that from an early Buddhist viewpoint monastics should accord to the welfare of others (MN 33). Then I turn to a debate between the Buddha and Saccaka (MN 35), examining in particular how far the notion of a transference of merit has roots in early Buddhist discourse.

I continue by studying a visit paid by Mahāmoggallāna to Sakka's heaven (MN 37) as a didactic tale which appears to exhibit considerable humour. In the next chapter I turn to an exposition of the fruits of basic ethical conduct (MN 41), examining the doubling of discourses as a feature of early Buddhist oral transmission.

The famous conversion of the brigand Aṅgulimāla is my next topic (MN 86), where I attempt to discern stages in the development of this dramatic tale. In relation to the lay patron Anāthapiṇ-

¹¹ A discourse not included here is my translation and study of SĀ 809, parallel to SN 54.9, published in Anālayo 2014g. This is scheduled to become part of another volume of collected papers on *Vinaya* studies at present under preparation.

dika (MN 143) I then discuss if teachings on insight were withheld from laity.

The attitude towards nuns is central to my examination of an instruction by Nandaka (MN 146), where I identify several aspects that make for a more negative portrayal of nuns in the Pāli version when compared to its parallels. A positive portrayal of nuns comes to the fore with the next chapter concerned with the collected sayings on nuns (SN 5). Here I also evaluate the role of Māra and argue that this has been misunderstood by some scholars.

Next I examine if according to the early discourses an arahant could commit suicide, based on a study of the cases of Vakkali (SN 22.87) and Channa (SN 35.87).

The report of how the Buddha's son Rāhula became an arahant (SN 35.121) leads me to discuss how, according to early Buddhist thought, teaching activities may contribute to one's own progress towards liberation.

A discourse on *satipaṭṭhāna* practice undertaken by nuns (SN 47.10) leads me to the question of whether the recurrent reference to "monks" as the audience of a discourse implies that instructions given in the body of the discourse were only meant for male monastics. In the following chapter I remain with the topic of *satipaṭṭhāna*, in particular studying the acrobat simile that illustrates the need to balance commitment to personal practice with concern for others (SN 47.19).

Continuing still further with the topic of *satipaṭṭhāna* I then undertake a comparative study of the sixteen steps of mindfulness of breathing and their relation to progress towards awakening (SN 54.13). Then I examine what according to tradition was the first discourse by the Buddha, whereby he set in motion the wheel of Dharma (SN 56.11). Here I critically review arguments proposed by some scholars that the four noble truths were not part of the early teachings.

In the next chapter I return to the topic of suicide by arahants, where the tale of Dabba (Ud 8.9) leads me to explore the development of the textual motif and the actual undertaking of self-cremation in early and later Buddhist tradition, and its possible origins in literalism.

Then I explore the Buddha's descent from the Heaven of the Thirty-three (Dhp-a 14.2), arguing that some versions of this tale appear to have been influenced by Indian art.

In the course of the above studies, a topic that comes up on several occasions is the relationship between a text and its commentary. In the two appendixes I explore this topic from the viewpoint of the relationship between discourse and commentary in general (appendix 1), before turning to the *Udāna* collection as exemplifying the relationship in particular between stanzas and accompanying prose narrative (appendix 2).

Conventions

Since a considerable part of my target audience will be familiar with the Pāli canon only, in what follows I employ Pāli terminology, except for anglicized terms like "Dharma" or "Nirvāṇa", without thereby intending to take a position on the original language of the *Samyukta-āgama* discourses or on Pāli language being in principle preferable. I am of course aware of the fact that in academic circles Sanskrit is the preferred language, since it best represents the pan-Buddhist literary traditions. But I hope that my colleagues will bear with me for what I believe to be a decision that will greatly facilitate access to my studies by those who are only familiar with Pāli terms.¹² For the same reason, I

¹² Needless to say, my decision is not meant to be in any way a reflection of the Indic original used for translation into Chinese. In relation to the similar decision by Bingenheimer 2011: 58, Zacchetti 2014: 258 speaks of a "loss of historical accuracy". Although I appreciate the concern to remain as faithful as

have arranged my studies in the sequence in which the respective discourses are found in the Pāli canon. The original order of the *Samyukta-āgama* discourses translated and studied in the present monograph can be seen in table 1 below.

In the case of those *Samyukta-āgama* discourses that have a parallel in the *Majjhima-nikāya*, I adopt the paragraph numbering used in the English translation of these discourses by Ñāṇamoli (1995/2005) in order to facilitate comparison. In the notes to the translations, I focus on selected differences in relation to the Pāli parallel. Abbreviations in the translation are usually found as such in the Chinese original.¹³ These are reproduced in the translations with an ellipsis and instructions in the original on the need to recite the elided text are given in italics.

In the translated texts, I use square brackets [] to indicate supplementation and angle brackets < > to mark emendation. In order to facilitate cross-referencing, I have also used square brackets in subscript to provide the pagination of the original Chinese text on which the translation is based, and to indicate the pagination and footnote or endnote numbering of the original paper, whenever

possible to the Indic original of a text preserved in Chinese translation, in the case of the *Āgamas* it seems to me the situation is less clear-cut than it can be with other texts. We can be fairly sure that none of the *Āgamas* was originally composed in Sanskrit (or in Pāli for that matter), thus it is only a circumstance of transmission that by the time of translation into Chinese the *Samyukta-āgama* had been Sanskritized. Whereas I would of course prefer to avoid criticism by my colleagues, the wish to make my studies more easily accessible to a readership that for a great part can be expected to have so far had exposure mainly to Pāli terminology only has remained a stronger concern of mine, together with the need to maintain consistency with the previously published collection of papers from the *Madhyama-āgama* and other such collections at present under preparation.

¹³ An exception is my translation of SN 35.121 below p. 274ff, where the Pāli editions differ in the degree to which they present the text in abbreviation.

these differ from the present annotation.¹⁴ When quoting various text editions, I have occasionally standardized or adjusted the punctuation.

Translation Terminology

When translating *Samyukta-āgama* discourses, I have attempted to stay close to the terminology adopted by Bhikkhu Bodhi in his renderings of the Pāli equivalents, to facilitate comparison. In the case of 苦, equivalent to *dukkha*, however, I simply keep the Pāli term, which at times does stand for outright "pain", but on many an occasion refers to "unsatisfactoriness", where translations like "suffering" or "pain" fail to convey adequately the sense of the passage in question. The standard rendering of *bhagavant* in the *Samyukta-āgama* is 世尊, literally "World Honoured One", in which case I follow Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation of the corresponding Pāli term and adopt the rendering "Blessed One".

In the case of 念處, literally "mindfulness sphere", I simply use the Pāli term *satipaṭṭhāna*,¹⁵ similarly for 慈 I use the Pāli equivalent *mettā*. In relation to 漏, corresponding to *āsava*, I employ the rendering "influx";¹⁶ and for 覺, counterpart to *bodhi*, I use "awakening".¹⁷

¹⁴ Due to revision of the original papers, at times these references to the earlier pagination or footnote numbering are not in sequential order.

¹⁵ On the inadequacy of the rendering "foundation of mindfulness" cf. Anālayo 2003: 29f.

¹⁶ For a more detailed discussion of the term *āsava* cf. Anālayo 2012j: 80–82.

¹⁷ On the significance of the term *bodhi* cf. Anālayo 2011b: xxiii and on the use of the philologically less apt rendering "enlightenment" as an aspect of Buddhist modernism Cohen 2010: 101; cf. also below p. 76 note 45.

Table 1: Translated *Samyukta-āgama* Discourses

SĀ no.:	Pāli no.:	Pāli title:
SĀ 110	MN 35	<i>Cūlasaccaka-sutta</i>
SĀ 200	SN 35.121 ¹⁸	<i>Rāhulovāda-sutta</i>
SĀ 276	MN 146	<i>Nandakovāda-sutta</i>
SĀ 344	MN 9	<i>Sammādiṭṭhi-sutta</i>
SĀ 379	SN 56.11	<i>Dhammacakkappavattana-sutta</i>
SĀ 505	MN 37	<i>Cūlatanḥāsāṅkhaya-sutta</i>
SĀ 506	Dhp-a 14.2	<i>Devorohaṇavatthu</i>
SĀ 615	SN 47.10	<i>Bhikkhunivāsaka-sutta</i>
SĀ 619	SN 47.19	<i>Sedaka-sutta</i>
SĀ 810	SN 54.13 ¹⁹	<i>Ānanda-sutta</i>
SĀ 1032	MN 143	<i>Anāthapiṇḍikovāda-sutta</i>
SĀ 1042	MN 41	<i>Sāleyyaka-sutta</i>
SĀ 1076	Ud 8.9–10	<i>Dabba-sutta</i>
SĀ 1077	MN 86	<i>Aṅgulimāla-sutta</i>
SĀ 1198–1207	SN 5.1–10	<i>Bhikkhunī-samyutta</i>
SĀ 1249	MN 33	<i>Mahāgopālaka-sutta</i>
SĀ 1265	SN 22.87	<i>Vakkali-sutta</i>
SĀ 1266	SN 35.87 ²⁰	<i>Channa-sutta</i>

Titles of the original publications:

"Attitudes Towards Nuns – A Case Study of the *Nandakovāda* in the Light of Its Parallels" (2010a); cf. below p. 155ff.

"*Bhikkhave* and *Bhikkhu* as Gender-inclusive Terminology in Early Buddhist Texts" (2014a); cf. below p. 293ff.

¹⁸ Cf. also MN 147.

¹⁹ Cf. also MN 118.

²⁰ Cf. also MN 144.

- "Channa's Suicide in the *Samyukta-āgama*" (2010b); cf. below p. 257ff.
- "The Chinese Parallels to the *Dhammacakkappavattana-sutta* (1)" (2012b); cf. below p. 347ff.
- "The Conversion of Aṅgulimāla in the *Samyukta-āgama*" (2008a); cf. below p. 121ff.
- "Dabba's Self-cremation in the *Samyukta-āgama*" (2012c); cf. below p. 389ff.
- "Defying Māra – *Bhikkhunīs* in the *Samyukta-āgama*" (2014d); cf. below p. 201ff.
- "The Development of the Pāli *Udāna* Collection" (2009c); cf. below p. 463ff.
- "Exemplary Qualities of a Monastic, The *Samyukta-āgama* Counterpart to the *Mahāgopālaka-sutta* and the Need of Balancing Inner Development with Concern for Others" (2010c); cf. below p. 41ff.
- "The Influence of Commentarial Exegesis on the Transmission of *Āgama* Literature" (2010d); cf. below p. 441ff.
- "Mindfulness of Breathing in the *Samyukta-āgama*" (2007c); cf. below p. 333ff.
- "Protecting Oneself and Others Through Mindfulness – The Acrobat Simile in the *Samyukta-āgama*" (2012i); cf. below p. 311ff.
- "Right View and the Scheme of the Four Truths in Early Buddhism, The *Samyukta-āgama* Parallel to the *Sammādiṭṭhi-sutta* and the Simile of the Four Skills of a Physician" (2011e); cf. below p. 11ff.
- "Saccaka's Challenge – A Study of the *Samyukta-āgama* Parallel to the *Cūlasaccaka-sutta* in Relation to the Notion of Merit Transfer" (2010g); cf. below p. 57ff.
- "Śakra and the Destruction of Craving – A Case Study in the Role of Śakra in Early Buddhism" (2011f); cf. below p. 91ff.

- "The *Samyukta-āgama* Parallel to the *Sāleyyaka-sutta*" (2006c); cf. below p. 105ff.
- "Teaching the Abhidharma in the Heaven of the Thirty-three, The Buddha and His Mother" (2012k); cf. below p. 415ff.
- "Teachings to Lay Disciples –The *Samyukta-āgama* Parallel to the *Anāthapiṇḍikovāda-sutta*" (2010i); cf. below p. 139ff.
- "Teaching and Liberation, Rāhula's Awakening in the *Samyukta-āgama*" (2012l); cf. below p. 273ff.
- "Vakkali's Suicide in the Chinese *Āgamas*" (2011h); cf. below p. 235ff.

Acknowledgement and Dedication

I am indebted to Marcus Bingenheimer, Bhikkhu Bodhi, Bhikkhu Brahmāli, Rod Bucknell, William Chu, Florin Deleanu, Martin Delhey, Bhikkhunī Dhammadinnā, Peter Harvey, Damien Keown, Shi Kongmu, Gisela Krey, Kuan Tse-fu, Michael Radich, Lambert Schmithausen, Ken Su, Bhikkhunī Tathālokā, Giovanni Verardi, and Monika Zin for comments and suggestions made in regard to one or more of the articles collected in this volume, and to the editors of the respective journals and books for their kind permission to reprint the material.

I would like to dedicate this book to the memory of Prof. (em.) Dr. Michael Hahn (1941–2014), without whose insistence that I learn Tibetan I would not have been able to undertake the type of comparative studies found in this volume. The need to know Tibetan is especially important in the case of the *Samyukta-āgama*, where Śamathadeva's *Abhidharmakośopāyikāṭīkā* has preserved a much greater number of parallel versions in Tibetan translation than exist for any other *Āgama*.

I would also like to apologize for any shortcomings in the translations or study parts in the following pages.